



**STATE OF NEW JERSEY**

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Wendy Collins,  
Supervising Emergency Medical  
Technician (PC2887W), Gloucester  
County

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2019-3524

**ISSUED:** September 12, 2019 (RE)

Wendy Collins appeals her rank and score for the promotional examination for Supervising Emergency Medical Technician (PC2887W), Gloucester County. The appellant received an unassembled examination score of 87.840, and a seniority score of 72.315, for a final average of 83.190, and she ranks 18<sup>th</sup> on the resultant eligible list.

The subject examination had a closing date of November 21, 2018, and was open to applicants in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the title Senior Emergency Medical Technician and who met the announced requirement of possession of a current and valid Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) Certification issued by the New Jersey Department of Health. Applicants who possessed the higher level certification as a Mobile Intensive Care Paramedic, or Mobile Intensive Care Registered Nurse Certification, issued by the New Jersey Department of Health, are considered to have met above certification requirement. The appellant was admitted as she was permanent in the title Senior Emergency Medical Technician. Eighteen candidates appeared on the eligible list, which has not yet been certified.

This examination was processed as an unassembled examination (UE), *i.e.*, candidates were ranked on the eligible list based on an evaluation of their education and experience as listed on their applications. The unassembled examination standard conferred a base score of 70.000 for all eligible applicants. Additional credit was awarded for ten years of experience as an Emergency Medical Technician or in the practice of emergency medical care. It is noted that no credit was given for

experience gained more than ten years prior to the examination closing date, in this case, December 2008.

The appellant listed ten positions on her application, eight of which were after December 2008. Those positions include Assistant to EMS Chief; Senior Emergency Medical Technician; President/Owner of Gwenco & Sons LLC (part-time, 30 hours per week); Director of Staff; Scheduling EMT; Supervising Emergency Medical Technician; Emergency Medical Technician; and Supervising EMT (part-time, 16 hours per week) for Franklin Township. Official records show a different employment history. These records indicate that the appellant was a Senior Emergency Medical Technician from March 2015 to the November 2018 closing date, and an Emergency Medical Technician from June 2008 to March 2015. As to scoring, the appellant received full credit for eight years, eleven months in six positions. She was not credited for her experience as a President/ Owner of Gwenco & Sons LLC (part-time, 30 hours per week), or as a Director of Staff.

On appeal, the appellant reiterates her experience ten years prior to the closing date, and argues that her training supersedes that of those who rank above her. She resubmits her certifications and provides a general overview of her experience.

## CONCLUSION

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an application may only be amended prior to the announced closing date for filing applications.

The appellant received full credit for her positions from September 2016 to November 2018, from April 2010 to September 2015, and from December 2008 to January 2010. From October 2015 to August 2016, the appellant was President/Owner of Gwenco & Sons LLC (part-time, 30 hours per week). This position did not have the practice of emergency medical care as a primary focus, and therefore the appellant was not credited for this time.

At this point, it should be noted that the appellant did not properly complete her application. From September 2016 to November 2018, the appellant listed three positions, Assistant to EMS Chief, Senior Emergency Medical Technician, Director of Staff, each as a full-time position (42 hours per week) and each for Gloucester County. Additionally, she listed that she worked 30 hours per week as President/Owner of Gwenco & Sons LLC from 2001 to the closing date. Thus, she is indicating that she worked 156 hours per week for two years, three months (42x3+30), although official records indicate that she was a Senior Emergency Medical Technician. There are only 168 hours in a week, so this is clearly an error in completing the application. For future applications, the appellant should only

list her current title and applicable duties. If she believes she is working out of title, she can request a classification review from the Division of Agency Services.

It is also noted that her duties as a Senior Emergency Medical Technician, except for two, overseeing daily operations and assisting the supervisor, were copied from the Examples of Work from the job specification of this title. Simply quoting the duties contained in the job specification on an application is not a sufficient basis on which to determine if a candidate's *specific* duties matches the experience requirements of a title. For eligibility purposes, candidates must demonstrate that the duties they perform qualify them for admission to the examination. *See In the Matter of Maxsine Allen and Vivian Stevenson* (MSB, decided March 10, 2004). Similarly, experience which mimics the job specification cannot be credited in an unassembled examination. An applicant who mimics a number of the characteristic tasks verbatim from the job specification does not establish that she is primarily engaged in or has experience in that type of work. Nevertheless, the appellant listed the practice of emergency medical care in one of her other positions, and therefore, received credit from September 2016 to November 2018. The appellant is cautioned to complete any future job applications in her own words.

Next, the official record indicates that she worked as a Senior Emergency Medical Technician without a separation in service from October 2015 to August 2016. It is unclear what the appellant was doing at that time at Gloucester County, whether she was working or her record is missing data, since her application and the resume provided on appeal do not account for this time. Nevertheless, as this is a competitive situation, with 18 candidates on the eligible list, her experience in this title cannot be changed. Since the application for the announcement is considered the "test paper," it is no more subject to later amendment than a multiple choice test answer sheet. Accordingly, additional experience not included on original test papers cannot be considered in the appeal process. *See In the Matter of Alex Westner* (Commissioner of Personnel, decided August 11, 1997).

In February and March 2010, the appellant had no experience other than her ownership of a construction business, which was inapplicable. Also, the appellant received full credit for her experience from December 2008 to January 2010 as a Supervising Emergency Medical Technician, although she worked 16 hours per week. As this was an error in scoring, the appellant's score was changed to reflect part-time hours in this position. Her score changed from 87.840 to 86.670, however, her ranking on the eligible list remains unchanged.

A thorough review of the record indicates that the decision of the Division of Agency Services is amply supported by the record, and appellant provides no basis to disturb that decision. The appellant has failed to meet her burden of proof in this matter.

**ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON  
THE 10<sup>th</sup> DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2019



Deirdre L. Webster Cobb  
Chairperson  
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries  
and  
Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers  
Director  
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs  
Civil Service Commission  
Written Record Appeals Unit  
P. O. Box 312  
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Wendy Collins  
Chad Bruner  
Kelly Glenn  
Records Center